



**MICHAEL A. CARDOZO**  
*Corporation Counsel*

**THE CITY OF NEW YORK**  
**LAW DEPARTMENT**  
100 CHURCH STREET  
NEW YORK, NY 10007

**JAY A. KRANIS**  
Special Federal Litigation Division  
TEL: 212-788-8683  
FAX: 212-788-9776

April 12, 2005

VIA ECF AND BY HAND  
The Honorable Kenneth M. Karas  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl Street  
New York, New York 10007-1312

**Re: Macnamara, et al., v. City of New York, et al.,  
04 Civ. 9216 (KMK)**

Dear Judge Karas:

Pursuant to Your Honor's April 1, 2005, Order, the parties submit the following joint letter to update the Court on developments since the last conference:

1. Answers were filed on behalf of Defendants Ingram, Phillips, Rodriguez, Filoseta, Sam, Riggan, Diez, Balicki, Mason, Roman and Choinski; and
2. Defendants' counsel transmitted to Plaintiffs' a proposed Case Management Order.

With respect to Item No. 6, please be advised that counsel for Plaintiffs and Defendants are in favor of consolidation for discovery, but not for trial.

Respectfully submitted,

Jay A. Kranis (JK 2576)  
Assistant Corporation Counsel

cc: Jonathan C. Moore, Esq.(via facsimile - (212) 674-4614)